

# **PEMSEA/WP/2020/45**

PROCEEDINGS OF THE FINAL PROJECT STEERING COMMITTEE MEETING OF THE GEF/UNDP/PEMSEA PROJECT ON SCALING UP IMPLEMENTATION OF THE SDS-SEA

ZOOM Virtual Meeting 18 December 2020





# PROCEEDINGS OF THE FINAL PROJECT STEERING COMMITTEE MEETING OF THE GEF/UNDP/PEMSEA PROJECT ON SCALING UP IMPLEMENTATION OF THE SDS-SEA

ZOOM VIRTUAL MEETING 18 DECEMBER 2020

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Executive Summary	2
Introduction	3
1.0 Opening of the Meeting and Approval of the Meeting Agenda	3
2.0 Matters Arising from the PSC Meeting 2019	4
3.0 Overall Project Accomplishments	4
4.0 Terminal Evaluation Findings and Recommendations	7
5.0 Project Closure and Implementation	13
6.0 Country Commitments and Continuing Support to SDS-SEA Implementation	13
7.0 Closing of the PSC Meeting	16
	. –
Annex 1: List of Participants Annex 2: Agenda of the Meeting	17 23
	20

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

The Final Project Steering Committee Meeting of the **GEF/UNDP/PEMSEA Project on Scaling up the Implementation of the Sustainable Development Strategy for the Seas of East Asia (SDS-SEA)** was conducted virtually through a zoom video conference call on 18 December 2020. The Meeting was attended by representatives from eight project participating countries, namely: Cambodia, China, Indonesia, Lao PDR, Philippines, Thailand, Timor-Leste and Vietnam. Representatives from the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) Philippines were present on behalf of the Global Environment Facility (GEF) and the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). Representatives from the China-PEMSEA Center and PEMSEA Network of Learning Centers participated as observers. The SDS-SEA Terminal Evaluation Consultants at the international level as well as national consultants from the eight project member countries were present as key resource persons. The PEMSEA Resource Facility (PRF) served as Secretariat for the Meeting.

Overall, the meeting focused on the key achievements or progress of the project from 2014 to 2020, the initial findings, assessment and recommendations from the ongoing project terminal review, and the work plan for the completion of the project's operational and financial closure.

The Final PSC Meeting made the following major recommendations:

- The PRF to validate the coverage of Integrated Coastal Management (ICM) in the region and to document ICM key accomplishments to serve as basis in further scaling-up of ICM to other sites in the future.
- The PRF and the Terminal Review to highlight the key accomplishments and contribution of the project in support of climate change adaptation and in strengthening resilience of coastal communities.
- The Terminal Review Team to finalize the first draft of the Terminal Evaluation report for dissemination to PSC members on the week of December 21, 2020 for review.
- PSC members to submit their comments on the draft Terminal Evaluation report by January 8, 2021.
- The adoption of the proposed work plan and timeline to complete the operational and financial closure of the project.

# PROCEEDINGS OF THE FINAL PROJECT STEERING COMMITTEE MEETING FOR THE GEF/UNDP/PEMSEA PROJECT ON SCALING UP THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY FOR THE SEAS OF EAST ASIA (SDS-SEA)

# Zoom Virtual Meeting 18 December 2020

## INTRODUCTION

- i. The Final Project Steering Committee Meeting of the GEF/UNDP/PEMSEA Project on Scaling up the Implementation of the Sustainable Development Strategy for the Seas of East Asia (SDS-SEA) was conducted virtually through a zoom video conference call on 18 December 2020.
- ii. The Meeting was attended by representatives from eight project participating countries, namely: Cambodia, China, Indonesia, Lao PDR, Philippines, Thailand, Timor-Leste and Vietnam.
- iii. Representatives from the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) Philippines were present on behalf of the Global Environment Facility and UNDP. Representatives from China-PEMSEA Center and PEMSEA Network of Learning Centers participated as observers.
- iv. The SDS-SEA Terminal Evaluation Consultants at the international level as well as national consultants from the eight countries were present as key resource persons. The PEMSEA Resource Facility (PRF) served as Secretariat for the Meeting.
- v. The Meeting was co-chaired by Dr. Selva Ramachandran, Resident Representative of UNDP Philippines, and Ms. Floradema Eleazar, Programme Manager of UNDP Philippines.
- vi. The full list of participants is given in Annex 1.

# 1.0 OPENING OF THE PROJECT STEERING COMMITTEE MEETING AND APPROVAL OF MEETING AGENDA

1.1 Dr. Selva Ramachandran, Resident Representative of UNDP Philippines, welcomed all the country delegates and participants to the meeting. Dr. Ramachandran indicated that while the Project was supposed to end in August 2020, further extension was granted by the GEF taking into consideration the challenges brought about by the COVID-19 pandemic. He expressed his sincere gratitude to all the stakeholders for their commitment and support that enabled the project to reach its goals and targets despite the different challenges. He emphasized that the Project represents the transformation phase of GEF support culminating in the sustainability of PEMSEA as the regional coordinating mechanism for the SDS-SEA implementation, with strong linkage to river basins and coastal and marine environmental management, as well as on the promotion of local, national and regional investment processes on blue economy. Dr. Ramachandran underscored the key roles of participating countries in developing the SDS-SEA as the framework for planning, implementing, monitoring and evaluation of PEMSEA's work that covers key management programs (i.e., climate change adaptation and disaster risk reduction, marine biodiversity conservation, and pollution reduction). While the Project is already wrapping up, Dr. Ramachandran looks forward to the continued partnership with PEMSEA, particularly in the forthcoming implementation of the ASEAN/UNDP/PEMSEA Project on Integrated River Basin Management (IRBM). Lastly, he wished the meeting a full success and closed his opening remarks with greetings for a better 2021 for all.

- 1.2 Ms. Aimee Gonzales, PEMSEA Executive Director, presented the agenda for the meeting.
- 1.3 The meeting adopted the agenda as presented. The agenda is found in Annex 2.

# 2.0 MATTERS ARISING FROM THE PSC MEETING 2019

- 2.1 Ms. Cristine Ingrid Narcise, PRF Country Programme Manager, presented a summary of the actions taken in line with the decisions from the two PSC Meetings conducted in April and July 2019.
- 2.2 The 2019 decisions focused mainly on the approval of the project extension, the reallocation of budget from the regional component to countries with budget shortfalls (i.e., Cambodia, Indonesia and Timor Leste), the corresponding Project Work Plans and Budget for 2019 and 2020, as well the conduct of Project Terminal Evaluation. Ms. Narcise reported that all the decisions were acted upon and completed.

# Conclusion

2.3 The Meeting noted the actions taken in line with the recommendations and decisions from the two PSC Meetings undertaken in 2019.

# 3.0 OVERALL PROJECT ACCOMPLISHMENTS

#### Presentation Highlights

3.1 Ms. Nancy Bermas, Project Manager for SDS-SEA Project, presented the major accomplishments of the project from 2014 to 2020. The project covered three components (Partnerships in coastal and ocean governance, Healthy and resilient marine and coastal ecosystems, and Knowledge platform for building a sustainable ocean-based blue economy), supported by 10 outcomes with activities and initiatives spanning from local, national, subregional, regional and international levels with the engagement of a wide range of partners and stakeholders.

- 3.2 With strong commitment and support from Country and Non-Country Partners and various collaborators, the Project has delivered significant achievements. Some of the major accomplishments under Component 1 particularly focusing on the establishment of a self-sustaining, country-owned regional mechanism included: voluntary country contributions from China, Japan, RO Korea, Singapore and Timor-Leste, continued commitment by the Government of the Philippines to host the PRF; co-hosting by Country Partners of key PEMSEA events and activities, partnership agreements with Non-Country Partners and collaborators in support of SDS-SEA implementation; development of innovative products and services to generate new streams of revenue to augment the voluntary contributions; engaging the private sector in blue economy development and ICM program implementation and establishing innovative investment mechanisms that support SDS-SEA implementation, including identifying business cases and developing pilot investment cases to improve capacity in and understanding of investment services and continuing development of new projects for multilateral and bilateral donor funding. The presentation also highlighted the support provided by the project for the development and initiation of national and ocean policies and review of sectoral legislations in line with ICM and SDS-SEA, and the completion of regional and national State of Oceans and Coasts reports with examples of countries' implementation of Blue Economy.
- 3.3 Under Component 2, the project has exceeded its 20 percent ICM target coverage with about 73,275 km or 46.7 percent of the region's coastline (from 8 countries) now under ICM. Countries also reported on their various initiatives to address key issues related to biodiversity and habitat protection and management, pollution reduction, sustainable fisheries and livelihood, and natural and man-made hazards. Several ports in the region have also continued to implement Port Safety, Health, Environmental Management System (PSHEMS), while the three littoral countries in the Gulf of Thailand have made significant developments in support of environmental sensitivity mapping and contingency planning on oil spills.
- 3.4 Under Component 3, more than 7,000 stakeholders have benefited from various capacity building initiatives. Different knowledge products as well as an online knowledge platform (SEA Knowledge Bank) was established as a regional knowledge hub for coastal and ocean governance and blue economy. Various networks have also expanded including the PEMSEA Network of Learning Centers (PNLC), PEMSEA Network of Local Governments (PNLG), and the Regional Centers of Excellence (RCOEs). The project has also provided PEMSEA the opportunity to participate and co-organize a number of key global and regional learning events, particularly the UN SDG conference, ASEAN and International Waters conferences and IW LEARN regional workshops to share knowledge and accomplishments on ICM scaling up and investments on sustainable coastal and ocean development,
- 3.5 The strong commitments from Country and Non-Country Partners and other supporting organizations are also evident in the amount of co-financing that has been generated under the Project, amounting to more than USD290 million exceeding the committed co-financing of USD157 million as indicated in the Project Document.

3.6 Building on the achievements under the Project as well as on the 27-year history of PEMSEA, Ms. Bermas also highlighted key elements that would help sustain the gains under the SDS-SEA implementation and scaling up. This included sustainability at the country and local level through the institutionalization and mainstreaming of Integrated Coastal Management (ICM) into the development and investment planning of the national and local governments, continued capacity building, networking, monitoring and evaluation, as well as assessment of ICM effectiveness. Several pipeline projects and ongoing discussions with various donor agencies were also highlighted which would be significant in sustaining PRF's financial sustainability.

# Discussion Highlights

- 3.7 The meeting noted the achievements made by the project and congratulated the project member countries, the PRF, and other supporting organizations for the significant results of their hard work, partnership and collaboration. The meeting also noted the need to sustain the gains from the project, including the PEMSEA Resource Facility's operations through various funding streams and mechanisms (e.g., GCF accreditation and EU pillar assessment).
- 3.8 Atty. Analiza Rebuelta-Teh, Undersecretary of the Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR) of the Philippines, provided the following suggestions:
  - (a) Conduct further validation of the ICM coverage in the region to serve as baseline in identifying next steps and further scaling up or replication of ICM;
  - (b) Further expound the achievements made by the Project in line with climate change adaptation and strengthening of coastal community resilience;
  - (c) In light of the COVID-19 pandemic, documentation on the experiences gained based on interventions made by the Project at the community level could serve as a useful guide in establishing linkages and identifying/designing useful interventions for coastal communities and linking them with human health.
- 3.9 Ms. Bermas confirmed that further validation and assessment of ICM effectiveness will be conducted or replicated in PEMSEA countries in the coming years, building on the experience of the Project on the Third-Party assessment undertaken for the ICM initiatives in the Philippines (covering initiatives in 34 provinces and municipalities under the GEF/UNDP/PEMSEA project, national programs and programs/projects supported by other donors in the country) using key indicators from the ICM Code. Ms. Bermas further informed the meeting that ICM effectiveness assessment with support from the Ministry of Natural Resources, China is being planned and that the conduct of the pilot assessment in China with opportunities for application in selected ICM sites in other countries can further enhance the set of indicators to measure effectiveness of ICM implementation across the region.
- 3.10 In terms of climate change adaptation initiatives, Ms. Bermas highlighted the development of Coastal Use Zoning Plans (CUZP) in some sites which integrate climate change and disaster risk reduction measures and aspects. She cited the example in Kien Giang Province, a flood prone area in Southern Vietnam, where in the process of developing the CUZP, the project built on the experiences and outputs from previous projects that focused on vulnerability assessments to enhance the plan. Rehabilitation

and management of mangrove areas in a number of sites were also cited as effective measures for climate change adaptation by enhancing habitat resilience and shoreline protection.

#### Conclusions

- 3.11 The significant achievements of the GEF/UNDP/PEMSEA Project on Scaling up Implementation from 2014 to 2020 is well recognized and mainly attributed to the strong partnership and collaboration by the countries, the PRF and various partner stakeholders.
- 3.12 Further validation of the ICM coverage in the region is integral to ensure that the basic elements of ICM are present in the sites that are covered by the estimates; to assess the effectiveness of ICM implementation, as well as to serve as key reference and baseline in further replicating and scaling-up of ICM initiatives.
- 3.13 The COVID-19 pandemic has highlighted the need to further strengthen resilience from man-made and natural disasters. Key experiences, outputs and accomplishments of the project could serve as basis for designing appropriate future interventions to help strengthen resilience of coastal communities.

#### Recommendations

The PSC recommended that:

- 3.14 The PRF validate the coverage of ICM in the region using agreed indicators and document ICM good practices to support scaling-up ICM to other sites in the future.
- 3.15 The PRF and the Terminal Review highlight the key accomplishments and contribution of the project in support of climate change adaptation and in strengthening resilience in coastal communities.

# 4.0 TERMINAL EVALUATION FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

#### Presentation Highlights from the International Consultant

- 4.1 Ms. Stephanie Hodge, International Consultant and independent evaluator, delivered her initial findings and assessment in line with the ongoing Terminal Review of the Project.
- 4.2 The Terminal Review considered the following evaluation criteria: relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability and impact, including the different factors and processes that affected project delivery. It was emphasized that in response to the travel limitations posed by COVID-19, the conduct of the Terminal Review was unique in such a way that it has engaged the support of corresponding national consultants to help undertake review of project implementation at national and local levels in the eight countries. The key methods used were mainly document reviews, virtual

meetings/interviews, site visits in countries where local travel is allowed, focus group discussions, surveys, web metrics, and various synthesis exercises.

- 4.3 Ms. Hodge highlighted the following initial key findings or assessment pertaining to Relevance:
  - (a) The project's work is increasingly recognized as highly relevant to the current national, regional and global sustainable development, oceans and coastal environmental agenda and needs
  - (b) Capacity development is considered as one of the strengths of the project which is organized at regional, nation and local levels with the engagement of the learning centers (e.g., PNLC), including the development of cutting-edge tools (e.g., State of the Coasts), and implementation of pilot activities with multisectoral engagement; and
  - (c) The Iloilo Ministerial Declaration 2018 reaffirmed the respective governments to support PEMSEA's operation through voluntary contributions beyond 2019. However, Ms. Hodge believes that science-based decision making needs to be further strengthened, and budget needs and potential financial shortfalls in 2021 need to be further highlighted. She pointed out that it is important to assess the governance mechanism of PEMSEA and for partners to consider the need to move beyond voluntary contributions for a more consistent funding stream for PEMSEA.
- 4.4 In terms of Effectiveness, the following initial key findings were shared:
  - (a) The project met all of its expected targets on time and was effective to implement the work plan to the satisfaction of almost all interviewed members and Non-Country Partners;
  - (b) Excellent country support and use of Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) and adaptive management was highlighted in the project; and
  - (c) The 12-month project extension, as well as the additional 4-month extension in view of COVID-19 have enabled the countries who were behind schedule to undertake essential deliverables. The extension also allowed the project to realign its work plan and budget focusing on high-impact activities.
- 4.5 In terms of Efficiency, Ms. Hodge highlighted the following findings:
  - (a) Although the project has had notable successes, it was challenging to assess the concentration of portfolio resources and the value-added against the expected results, thus there is a need for more inclusive design work and cost-benefit analysis of ICM implementation at the national and local levels;
  - (b) Lack of funding made it difficult for PEMSEA to retain staff on core work particularly in developing flagship products and tools;
  - (c) Lack of clarity in considering outsourcing and partnering to deliver key outputs in a cost-efficient manner;
  - (d) Extent of engagement of learning centers at the national level (i.e., SOC monitoring and assessments) were not clear.
- 4.6 Overall, Ms. Hodge, rated the project delivery as Satisfactory with components 1 and 3 achieving majority of the end-of-project targets, while component 2 has not fully achieved end-of-project targets due to some delays in implementation compounded by the pandemic.

#### Key Findings and Insights from National Reviews

- 4.7 Mao Hak, National Consultant for Cambodia, highlighted several key Dr. accomplishments under each of the project outcomes, including: the completion of national SOC and local SOC reports in ICM sites, development of White Paper, National Guideline on the Use of Dispersants and Contingency Plan for Oil Spill, completion of Sihanoukville's pollution loading assessment report and continuing operationalization of its environmental laboratory, addressing saltwater intrusion through mangrove protection in Kep Province which can be replicated to other areas, the mobilization of other sources of funding for environmental conservation through the application of user fees for tourists and engaging other partners, the conduct of and participation to various local and international trainings, the demarcation of protected area boundaries and implementation of regulation on illegal settlements, among others. Overall, Dr. Mao rated project delivery in the country as satisfactory and commended the substantial success and the support extended to the beneficiaries despite the limited funding and broad scope of project coverage.
- 4.8 Prof. Quan Wen, National Consultant for China, underscored the strong buy in of local governments or local stakeholders in the project which is evident in the increase of ICM sites in China starting from Xiamen from Phase 1 of the project to the current 22 sites. The key driving factors behind the continued support to ICM was attributed to the benefits not only in terms of capacity building but more importantly in producing results and improvement at the environmental, ecosystem, livelihood aspects and the quality of life of the people. The good work at the local level also provided a strong foundation and reference for national-level activities and plans, particularly on ecosystem and habitat rehabilitation programs of China. Prof. Wen also highlighted the importance of the ICM Code to evaluate sustainable development capacity in coastal areas and encouraged PEMSEA to further enhance the ICM Code in the next stage of SDS-SEA implementation. With the ICM culture already established and embraced, he believes that it is crucial to further develop ICM to a new field or direction to meet new requirements and needs of coastal communities and countries in the region, including the need to enhance adaptive capacities of coastal ecosystems.
- 4.9 Ir. Wahyu Indraningsih, National Consultant for Indonesia, emphasized that at the national level, the commitment of Indonesia to help sustain SDS-SEA implementation and PEMSEA initiatives is evident in the strong coordination by the National Focal Ministry with other relevant ministries, which resulted in a draft agreement between the ministries to ratify the international legal recognition of PEMSEA. The Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Indonesia, in particular, has already submitted a letter to the Indonesian President requesting for the preparation of a Presidential Regulation regarding the ratified agreement, and this is currently awaiting the President's approval. The regulation will provide a legal basis for Indonesia to provide voluntary contribution to PEMSEA and to further strengthen coordination to support SDS-SEA implementation. Ir. Indraningsih also highlighted the strong involvement of ICM learning centers in the implementation of ICM in the local sites. While some sites demonstrated strong coordination among local stakeholders and agencies, frequent changes in government officials (i.e., case of East Lombok Regency and Bali Province) can affect project implementation and thus need to be considered. The change in regulation that shifted

authority for marine and coastal management to the provincial level also affected the mainstreaming of some project results to provincial government programs, including the strengthening of MPAs in Bontang City and Bali, and enhancing conservation of marine turtles in Sukabumi Regency, among others. There is a need to continually improve coordination between the regencies and the provincial governments in order to address this. Recommendations were also made to scale up the project results on community-based waste management in Semarang in line with the city's master plan. Overall, Ir. Indraningsih rated the project delivery in Indonesia as satisfactory.

- 4.10 Dr. Phetyasone Xaypanya, National Consultant for Lao PDR, provided some examples of key accomplishments in Lao PDR. This included the development of Guideline on Water Resources Fee, the promotion of the implementation of the updated Law on Water and Water Resources that was enacted in 2017, the development of the Strategy on National Water and Water Resource Management, development and approval of 3 sub-river basin management plans in the southern provinces of Lao, and monitoring of water quality of the subriver basins in Sedone. In Dr. Xaypanya's assessment, project targets in Lao are already at 95 percent completion. Based on this and on the high level of engagement of stakeholders both at the local and national level on the project, Dr. Xaypanya rated the project delivery in Lao PDR as satisfactory. He underscored the small amount of budget for the project which had implemented a lot of activities involving the different stakeholders, and supported the enforcement of laws and regulations. He also underscored the project's involvement of the national and local levels and its consideration of the priorities at the local level particularly the communities.
- 4.11 Based on project implementation in the Philippines, Mr. Rafael Camat, Jr., National Consultant for the Philippines, provided highly satisfactory ratings to seven outcomes of the project and satisfactory ratings to two outcomes (innovative financing mechanisms, and pollution reduction). He also rated the project implementation and adaptive management as highly satisfactory, and the sustainability of the project as likely. In support of these ratings, he highlighted key achievements in the Philippines under the ten outcomes. In particular, Mr. Camat highlighted the significant work of PEMSEA in helping the country harmonize its ICM policies. The preparation of ICM plans also enabled the sites to identify key problems, identify solutions and develop implementation plans that are specific, measurable, achievable, relevant and timebound. The development of SOCs also provided a deeper understanding of the allocation of budget on ICM implementation by the different ICM sites in the Philippines, which makes sustainability of ICM implementation in the sites likely.
- 4.12 Ms. Saisunee Chaksuin, National Consultant for Thailand, indicated that ICM is highly recognized in Thailand given the long history of ICM implementation, particularly in Chonburi Province. Under the current project, Thailand was able to commence the project a bit late compared to other countries, with some activities initiated only in 2018 which was further affected by limitations due to the pandemic. Despite the delay, scaling up of ICM in Chonburi has delivered a number of good results including on climate change and disaster risk reduction, oil spill management, and preparation of an integrated environmental monitoring plan. For the other three learning sites (Chantaburi, Rayong, and Trat Provinces), varying outputs were noted. All three

provinces started with very limited baseline data. With the project's support, Rayong Province was able to establish baseline information to support pollution reduction initiatives, which is in line with the provincial and national strategies, thus Rayong was able to get strong support from the provincial government as well as from the private sector in the area. In Chanthaburi Province, the focus was on habitat protection and rehabilitation. Key results in Chanthaburi included the establishment of an institutional arrangement that included the community, and the development of a draft mangrove In the case of Chantaburi Province, the efforts focused on rehabilitation plan. promoting sustainable fisheries including combatting of illegal, unregulated and unreported (IUU) fishing. To address this, Ecosystem Approach to Fisheries Management (EAFM) was introduced and trainings were conducted with some support also coming from SEAFDEC. To date, a sustainable fishery management plan that includes actions to combat IUU fishing has been drafted in Trat. Overall, Ms. Chaksuin highlighted the significant impact of the project in terms of improved partnership and relationship among communities and the local governments, as well as increase in scientific knowledge.

- 4.13 In the case of Timor-Leste, Dr. Augusto Lourdes da Silva, National Consultant for Timor-Leste, highlighted three major messages or impacts of the project that were identified by various stakeholders during his interviews: (a) improvements brought about by alternative livelihood initiatives (i.e., increase in household income); (b) increased understanding and capacities on coastal and marine resources management; and (c) improvement in METT rating in the MPA in Atauro Island. The impact of good results from the three local sites (Dili, Manatuto, and Liquica) were also considered in national programs as well as in policy making related to coastal and ocean protection. At the national level, Dr. da Silva highlighted the stakeholders' recognition of PEMSEA's contributions towards ocean and coastal governance and blue economy development. He further underscored the value of PEMSEA as a knowledge platform, bringing in knowledge and regional experience to Timor-Leste. Apart from these successes, Dr. da Silva also highlighted several challenges including the need to further strengthen government buy-in citing the delay in approval of the National Ocean Policy due to the country's political situation. He also mentioned the limitations in terms of resources and staff working on the project initiatives. Dr. da Silva emphasized the importance of sustaining the gains achieved under the PEMSEA project, to further build knowledge on coastal and ocean governance. The coordinating role of PEMSEA is also integral to bring in science into policies.
- 4.14 On behalf of Dr. Nguyen Thi The Nguyen, National Consultant for Vietnam, Dr. Nguyen My Hang, Deputy Director Department of Science, Technology and International Cooperation of Vietnam Administration of Seas and Islands, highlighted the significant contribution of PEMSEA in implementing the Agenda 2030 on sustainable development goals at the global and regional level. At the national level, efforts related to SDS-SEA implementation have resulted to various policies and plans including the approval of the Strategy for Sustainable Development of Marine Economy to 2030 and Vision to 2045. Vietnam also affirmed its cooperation with PEMSEA as well as with other agencies such as the Asian Development Bank, the World Bank and other entities on initiatives contributing to healthy oceans, economic prosperity and food security. Vietnam also

committed to continue working with PEMSEA countries and to promote knowledge exchange.

#### Discussion Highlights

- 4.15 The PSC congratulated the Terminal Evaluation Team for successfully undertaking the evaluation despite the limitations in time, as well as the challenges brought about by COVID-19.
- 4.16 The PSC noted the initial findings, ratings and recommendations arising from the ongoing Terminal Evaluation, which are in general positive and encouraging for the region.
- 4.17 The PSC noted that the national consultants will be submitting their country review or reports, and that the complete first draft of Terminal Review will be circulated to the PSC members for further review.
- 4.18 Mr. Dida Migfar Ridha, Director of Marine and Coastal Pollution and Degradation Control, Ministry of Environment and Forestry, Indonesia highlighted the importance of the findings and recommendations from the Terminal Review as basis for the continuation of efforts on the next stage of SDS-SEA implementation. He further emphasized the importance placed by Indonesia on their commitment under the Iloilo Ministerial Declaration on the provision of country contributions to PEMSEA beyond 2019 and expressed their commitment to support and sustain the successes made by the project.

#### Conclusion

4.19 Sustaining the substantial accomplishments of the project through strengthened support from countries and partners is integral in ensuring the achievement of the region's overall goal of sustainable East Asian Seas.

#### Recommendations

The PSC recommended that:

- 4.20 The Terminal Review Team finalize the first draft of the Terminal Evaluation report for dissemination to PSC members on the week of December 21, 2020 for review.
- 4.21 PSC members submit their comments on the draft Terminal Evaluation report by January 8, 2021.

# 5.0 PROJECT CLOSURE AND IMPLEMENTATION

#### **Presentation Highlights**

- 5.1 Ms. Bermas presented the SDS-SEA Project Closure Plan and Implementation. The operational and financial closure of the project will be undertaken from December 2020 to April 2021, focusing on the following key activities and deliverables:
  - (a) Submission of country feedback on the draft terminal evaluation report by first week of January 2021;
  - (b) Completion of the Project Terminal Evaluation including management response before the end of January 2021;
  - (c) Submission of Annual Progress Report (APR) and Quality Assurance Report (QAR) for 2020 before end of January 2021;
  - (d) Closing of all contractual obligations between December until January 2021;
  - (e) Transfer of acquired assets to PEMSEA by early February 2021 in coordination with UNDP Philippines;
  - (f) Conduct of final HACT Audit on the project between February to March 2021;
  - (g) Submission of Project Final Report by March 2021 and Audit Report by April 2021; and
  - (h) Completion of the PEMSEA Story (from Phase 1 to Phase 4) in March 2021.
- 5.2 The project budget balance is at USD356, 150.24 which will be utilized to cover the remaining activities.
- 5.3 A number of key knowledge products developed by the project will also be shared or transferred to key PEMSEA partners and networks.

#### Recommendation

5.4 The PSC recommended the adoption of the proposed work plan and timeline to complete the operational and financial closure of the project as presented.

# 6.0 COUNTRY COMMITMENTS AND CONTINUING SUPPORT TO SDS-SEA IMPLEMENTATION

#### **Statement of Cambodia**

6.1 On behalf of Cambodia, Mr. Long Rithirak, Deputy Director General of the Ministry of Environment (MOE), expressed sincere appreciation to PEMSEA for the support extended to Cambodia under the different phases of the SDS-SEA project. Mr. Long highlighted a number of benefits gained by the country as a PEMSEA partner. In particular, he underscored the: (a) successful expansion of ICM coverage to all the provinces in the country, (b) the trust built with various sectors and stakeholders under the common and integrated framework of PEMSEA; and (c) the strong coordination established with Gulf of Thailand countries on oil spill preparedness and response. The foundation provided by the PEMSEA partnership has also contributed to leveraging new partnerships and additional funding to address emerging problems in the country such

as plastic waste management. With support from the Government of Sweden and UNDP, a circular economy strategy and action plan was developed. The Government of Japan with UNDP also recently signed a USD 3million grant agreement to address marine pollution and promote 4Rs (refuse, reduce, reuse, recycle). As part of their continuing commitment to SDS-SEA and other international instruments, Mr. Long emphasized MOE's commitment together with relevant ministries in the country on the continued implementation of the National Strategic Plan on Green Growth, the National Plan on Biodiversity, and Climate Change. Mr. Long reaffirmed Cambodia's continued support and collaborative work with PEMSEA for the sustainable management of oceans and coasts. In closing, Mr. Long extended his country's invitation to all for the East Asian Seas (EAS) Congress 2021 to be hosted by the Preah Sihanouk Province on December 1-4, 2021.

#### Statement of China

On behalf of China, Ms. Heyun Xu, Division Director of Department of International 6.2 Cooperation, Ministry of Natural Resources, expressed China's continued support to PEMSEA's sustainability. Ms. Xu underscored that the project has provided important benefits to the country's efforts on coastal and marine environmental protection and development initiatives. She further thanked GEF, UNDP, other PEMSEA Partners and the PRF for their support in the implementation of the SDS-SEA. For China, the EAS region is a big community that requires coordinated development and joint efforts by all members. Partnership and cooperation on ICM implementation are integral in order to improve the level of marine protection and to realize sustainable development for the Ms. Xu emphasized that Integrated Coastal Management is a deeply rooted region. concept having been implemented in China under the four phases of the PEMSEA project. Thus, the concept of ICM has already been integrated into the policy and program planning of China at all levels. This, therefore, ensures the continued implementation of ICM in the country even after the end of the current GEF/UNDP/PEMSEA Project. Ms. Xu reiterated China's continued commitment to support PEMSEA with the implementation of the SDS-SEA.

#### **Statement of Indonesia**

6.3 On behalf of Indonesia, Mr. Dida Migfar Ridha of the Ministry of Environment and Forestry (MoEF), congratulated all the stakeholders for the successful implementation of the project and acknowledged their tireless work to ensure the effective delivery of the project targets. Mr. Ridha indicated that for Indonesia, the SDS-SEA implementation is not a mere project, but a package of applicable principles of existing national, regional and international programs and instruments, as well as an implementation approach to achieve sustainable development of the East Asian Seas. Mr. Ridha reaffirmed that Indonesia is and will remain on board as part of the network of cooperation under the PEMSEA framework. Through integrated management solutions, Mr. Ridha believes that the region will be able to continue working towards a sustainable and resilient coasts and oceans for the region.

#### Statement of Lao PDR

6.4 On behalf of Lao PDR, Mr. Simmavalong Phonexay, Deputy Director-General of the Department of Water Resources, Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment (MONRE), expressed their agreement with the final project evaluation findings. Mr.

Phonexay emphasized the good and proactive synergy that has been established between PEMSEA and Lao PDR since it became an official PEMSEA Country Partner in 2008. Under the PEMSEA partnership and with support from the SDS-SEA project, a number of outstanding outputs and outcomes have been achieved. At the national level and policy level, the project was able to contribute in enhancing integrated river basin management in Sedone covering three provinces (Champasack, Saravanne, and Sekong) in the southern part of Lao PDR. Mr. Phonexay cited several key outputs, including the adoption of the Water Resources Law, improvement in river basin management, enhancement of technical capacities on water resource and use management, and most importantly the strong engagement and involvement of the community and local authorities in the implementation. In line with this, Mr. Phonexay expressed his country's sincere gratitude to UNDP, GEF, the PRF and various partners for their support particularly in the river basin in the southern part of Lao. Mr. Phonexay reaffirmed Lao PDR's support and commitment to the continued implementation of the SDS-SEA and congratulated all the project members for the success of the project.

#### Statement of the Philippines

6.5 On behalf of the Philippines, Mr. Angelito Fontanilla, Director of the Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR), highlighted the growing recognition on the importance and need for sustainability. He underscored that in order to sustain partnership initiatives far into the future, PEMSEA countries should continue to ensure the continuous and steadfast implementation of the SDS-SEA. Mr. Fontanilla reaffirmed the Philippines' commitment under the Iloilo Ministerial Declaration to provide assistance to PEMSEA for the effective implementation of the SDS-SEA, and to reinforce ICM as an overall approach to address cross-cutting environmental concerns. The DENR will also be working closely with the PRF and other partners for the implementation of PEMSEA's post-COVID-19 strategy and to ensure that resources and investments are allocated to drive changes that link human health and ecosystem health. Mr. Fontanilla reiterated the Philippine commitment as host country to the PEMSEA headquarters under the Host Agency Agreement so as to further facilitate the continuous and effective operation of the PEMSEA Resource Facility. The Philippines expressed optimism that the forthcoming EAS Congress 2021 will incite more support to PEMSEA's sustainability as well as to the continuous implementation of the SDS-SEA.

#### **Statement of Thailand**

6.6 On behalf of Thailand, Ms. Saowalak Winyoonuntakul of the Department of Marine and Coastal Resources, expressed appreciation to the GEF and UNDP for the financial support, as well as to the PRF, and all concerned agencies including the ICM Learning Centers in Thailand for their support in the implementation of the project. Although Thailand started implementing the project in its later stage, Ms. Winyoonuntakul confirmed that the country was able to complete all project components within the timeframe with the support of all project participants, and scaled up ICM implementation from Chonburi Province to Rayong, Chantaburi and Trat. In particular, she highlighted the importance of engaging the established provincial committees under the National Act on Promotion of Marine and Coastal Resources Management 2015, and establishing working groups for the SDS-SEA Project under these committees, as essential mechanisms that would help ensure the continuing implementation of the SDS-SEA and sustainability of ICM in each of the provinces.

#### Statement of Timor-Leste

6.7 On behalf of Timor-Leste, Mr. Mario Cabral, Project Coordinator at the Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries (MAF), expressed the country's gratitude for the opportunity to work with PEMSEA for the past 20 years. The long history of partnership had resulted to many advances in Timor-Leste, especially on alternative livelihood, economic development, habitat rehabilitation, policy development and implementation. As a result of the interventions, Timor-Leste is now seeing good changes on the ground particularly in the three coastal municipalities of Dili, Manatuto and Liquica. At the regional level, Mr. Cabral reiterated the continuing benefits provided by the PEMSEA platform in terms of cooperation and networking for learning and sharing of good practices. Mr. Cabral emphasized the importance for the region to continue working together in order to sustain the results that have been achieved through science, education and policy development.

#### Statement of Vietnam

6.8 On behalf of Vietnam, Dr. Nguyen My Hang from the Administration of Seas and Islands (VASI), Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment (MONRE), expressed their agreement on the findings of the terminal evaluation. Dr. Nguyen reiterated their continuing commitment for cooperation under PEMSEA in undertaking specific activities in support of the SDS-SEA implementation.

# 7.0 CLOSING OF THE PSC MEETING

7.1 Ms. Aimee Gonzales, PEMSEA Executive Director, expressed appreciation to all the Country Partners for their continued support and commitment to PEMSEA and to the next level of implementation of the SDS-SEA. She congratulated the project partners for the accomplishments under the project in transitioning towards blue economy. Building on this, she highlighted the need for the region to continue moving forward to tackle new and emerging challenges. With the closure of the GEF/UNDP/PEMSEA Project in Scaling up SDS-SEA implementation, Ms. Gonzales cited a number of key important initiatives that will be helpful in sustaining the gains and to step up to a next level of PEMSEA and SDS-SEA transformation. These include the need to continue the (a) use of the SOC reporting mechanism as a significant tool in evaluating and assessing changes, (b) capacity building initiatives, and (c) development of communications and knowledge products, best practices and tools to document and tell a compelling story of PEMSEA. Ms. Gonzales highlighted the uniqueness of PEMSEA as a partnership mechanism that is wholly owned by countries in the region, unlike other regional bodies that were mandated by a UN convention. However, in order to sustain the PEMSEA mechanism, she emphasized the integral role of countries in demonstrating ownership and leadership by investing in PEMSEA initiatives and the Secretariat. Through this, other donors will have more confidence in investing to PEMSEA programs and initiatives, as well as facilitate building of a diverse mix of revenues for PEMSEA. Ms. Gonzales accorded a special acknowledgment to Mr. Adrian Ross as the former PEMSEA Executive Director and Project Manager for his significant contribution on the success of the project. Further, Ms. Gonzales expressed her appreciation to the project team in PRF as well as all the PEMSEA Country and Non-Country Partners, members of various PEMSEA networks, and to UNDP and GEF for their catalytic support. In closing, Ms. Gonzales expressed hope to see a more active participation and engagement of partners particularly in the preparation and conduct of the seventh EAS Congress to be held in Cambodia in 2021.

- 7.2 On behalf of UNDP, the Chair joined the rest of the PSC members in congratulating the entire team for the success of the project as well as the successful organization and conduct of the final PSC meeting.
- 7.3 The Chair adjourned the meeting at 11:45AM (Manila time).

\*\*\*

Annex 1 LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

#### Final Project Steering Committee Meeting of the GEF/UNDP Project on Scaling up the Implementation of the Sustainable Development Strategy for the Seas of East Asia (SDS-SEA), Virtual Meeting, 18 December 2020

#### LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

#### CAMBODIA

Mr. Long Rithirak Deputy Director General Ministry of Environment #48, Samdech Preah Sihanouk Tonle Bassac, Chamkar Morn, Phnom Penh Kingdom of Cambodia

#### CHINA

Ms. Chen Danhong Deputy Director General Department of International Cooperation Ministry of Natural Resources #64 Funei Street, Xicheng District 100812 Beijing People's Republic China

Ms. Heyun Xu Division Director Department of International Cooperation Ministry of Natural Resources #64 Funei Street, Xicheng District 100812 Beijing People's Republic of China

#### **INDONESIA**

Mr. Dida Migfar Ridha
Director
Marine and Coastal Pollution and
Degradation Control
Ministry of Environment and Forestry
Building A, 6th Floor Jalan D.I. Panjaitan
Kav.
24 Kebon Nanas - Jakarta Timur 13410
Republic of Indonesia

Mr. Tedi Bagus Prasetyo
Directorate of Coastal and Marine Pollution and Degradation Control
Ministry of Environment and Forestry
Building A, 6th Floor Jalan D.I. Panjaitan
Kav.
24 Kebon Nanas - Jakarta Timur 13410
Republic of Indonesia

#### LAO PDR

Mr. Simmalavong Phonexay Deputy Director-General Department of Water Resources Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment Prime Minister Office Campus Ban Nahaidiow, Canthabury District Vientiane Capital, Lao PDR

Mr. Lan Phousavanh Acting Head of Water Utilization Management Division Department of Water Resources Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment Prime Minister Office Campus Ban Nahaidiow, Canthabury District Vientiane Capital, Lao PDR

Mr. Thatsakone Chounlamountry Deputy Head of Water Utilization Management Division Department of Water Resources Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment Prime Minister Office Campus Ban Nahaidiow, Canthabury District Vientiane Capital, Lao PDR

#### PHILIPPINES

Atty. Analiza Rebuelta-Teh Undersecretary Department of Environment and Natural Resources DENR Compound, Visayas Avenue, Diliman Quezon City Republic of the Philippines

Mr. Angelito Fontanilla Director Foreign Assisted and Special Projects Service Department of Environment and Natural Resources DENR Compound, Visayas Avenue, Diliman Quezon City Republic of the Philippines

Ms. Nilda Baling Biodiversity Management Bureau Department of Environment and Natural Resources DENR Compound, Visayas Avenue, Diliman Quezon City Republic of the Philippines

Ms. Jeslina Gorospe Department of Environment and Natural Resources DENR Compound, Visayas Avenue, Diliman Quezon City Republic of the Philippines

Ms. Maria Katrina Apaya Department of Environment and Natural Resources DENR Compound, Visayas Avenue, Diliman Quezon City Republic of the Philippines

Ms. Lendl Meniano Biodiversity Management Bureau Department of Environment and Natural Resources DENR Compound, Visayas Avenue, Diliman Quezon City **Republic of the Philippines** 

Ms. Hannah Louise Ritual Department of Environment and Natural Resources DENR Compound, Visayas Avenue, Diliman Quezon City Republic of the Philippines

Ms. Michelle Yu Biodiversity Management Bureau Department of Environment and Natural Resources DENR Compound, Visayas Avenue, Diliman Quezon City Republic of the Philippines

#### THAILAND

Mr. Ukkrit Satapoomin Director Marine and Coastal Resources Conservation Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment The Government Complex Building B, Cheangwattana 7 Road, Tung Song Hong, Lak Si Bangkok 10210, Kingdom of Thailand

Ms. Saowalak Winyoonuntakul Department of Marine and Coastal Resources The Government Complex Planning Division, 8th Floor, Building B, Chaengwattana 7 Road Tung Song Hong, Lak Si, Bangkok 10210 Kingdom of Thailand

#### TIMOR LESTE

Mr. Acacio Guterres Director General of Fisheries Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries (MAF) Dili, Timor Leste

Mr. Mario Cabral Project Coordinator

#### VIETNAM

Mr. Nguyen Que Lam Deputy Director General Viet Nam Administration of Seas and Islands (VASI), Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment (MONRE) Vietnam

Dr. Nguyen My Hang Deputy Director - Department of Science, Technology and International Cooperation (DSTIC) Viet Nam Administration of Seas and Islands (VASI), Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment (MONRE) Vietnam

Ms. Nguyen Thi Ngoc Hoan Official, DICST Vietnam Administration of Seas and Islands (VASI) 83 Nguyen Chi Thanh St. Dong da District, Hanoi Vietnam

Ms. Hoan Nguyen Vietnam Administration of Seas and Islands (VASI) 83 Nguyen Chi Thanh St. Dong da District, Hanoi Vietnam

Mr. Hung Tran Vietnam Administration of Seas and Islands (VASI) 83 Nguyen Chi Thanh St. Dong da District, Hanoi Vietnam

Mr. Loc Nguyen Vietnam Administration of Seas and Islands (VASI) 83 Nguyen Chi Thanh St. Dong da District, Hanoi Vietnam

#### **CHINA-PEMSEA CENTER**

Dr. Zhang Zhaohui Deputy Director CHINA-PEMSEA Sustainable Coastal Management Cooperation Center (CPC) P.R. China

Dr. Wang Shouqiang CHINA-PEMSEA Sustainable Coastal Management Cooperation Center (CPC) P.R. China

#### **UNDP** Philippines

Dr. Selva Ramachandran Resident Representative UNDP Manila 15th Floor North Tower, Rockwell Business Center Sheridan Sheridan Street corner United Street Highway Hills, 1554 Mandaluyong City Philippines

Ms. Floradema C. Eleazar, EnP Team Leader Climate Action Programme Team United Nations Development Programme Philippines 15<sup>th</sup> Floor, North Tower Rockwell Business Center Sheridan Sheridan St., corner United St. Highway Hills, 1550 Mandaluyong City Philippines

Mr. Michael Joseph Jaldon Programme Associate United Nations Development Programme Philippines 15<sup>th</sup> Floor, North Tower Rockwell Business Center Sheridan Sheridan St., corner United St. Highway Hills, 1550 Mandaluyong City Philippines Ms. Cecile Cruz United Nations Development Programme Philippines 15<sup>th</sup> Floor, North Tower Rockwell Business Center Sheridan Sheridan St., corner United St. Highway Hills, 1550 Mandaluyong City Philippines

# SDS-SEA TERMINAL EVALUATION CONSULTANTS

Ms. Stephanie Hodge International Consultant New York City USA

Dr. Mao Hak Khor 1, Khbal Tumnup Boeung Tumun, Meanchey, Phnom Pehn. Cambodia

Prof. Quan Wen No. 42, Linghe Street Dalian 116023, China

Ir.Wahyu Indraningsih Pondok Sukmajaya Permai Blok C3 No 7 Depok City, 16412 West Java, Indonesia

Dr. Phetyasone Xaypanya Nonkhilek Village, Sikhottabong Distrit Vientiane Capital, Lao PDR

Mr. Rafael E. Camat, Jr. Blk 7 Lot 25, Legislative Rd., Violago Homes, Batasan Hills, Quezon City, Metro Manila, Philippines

Ms. Saisunee Chaksuin 56/1 Paholyothin Soi 6, Samsen Nai, Phayathai, Bangkok 10400, Thailand

Dr. Augusto Lourdes da Silva Aimutin, Comoro, Dom Aleixo Timor Leste Dr. Nguyen Thi The Nguyen Thuy Loi University, 175 Tay Son St., Dong Da Dist., Hanoi Vietnam

#### PEMSEA NETWORK OF LEARNING CENTERS

Dr. Wansuk Senanan Assistant Professor, Department of Aquatic Sciences, Faculty of Science Burapha University Chonburi Province Thailand

Dr. Qinhua Fang Professor, College of the Environment & Ecology (CEE) Deputy Director, Coastal and Ocean Management Institute (COMI) Xiamen University, PR China

Dr. Ario Damar Director of Centre for Coastal and Marine Resources Studies Bogor Agricultural University Kampus IPB Baranangsiang JI. Raya Pajajaran No 1 Bogor, Indonesia

Prof. Marie Frances Nievales Associate Professor Division of Biological Sciences University of the Philippines – Visayas Miag-ao, Iloilo Philippines

Dr. Sakanan Plathong Director, Marine Science Learning Center Department of Biology, Faculty of Science, Prince of Songkla University, Hatyai Songkhla, 90112 Thailand

#### PEMSEA SECRETARIAT

Ms. Aimee Gonzales Executive Director PEMSEA Resource Facility Ms. Nancy Bermas Project Manager for SDS-SEA Project PEMSEA Resource Facility

Ms. Cristine Ingrid Narcise Country Programme Manager PEMSEA Resource Facility

Ms. Daisy Padayao Country Programme Manager PEMSEA Resource Facility

Ms. Mary Anne De la Peña Finance Specialist PEMSEA Resource Facility Ms. Karen See Secretariat Coordinator PEMSEA Resource Facility

Ms. Kathrine Rose Aguiling Consultant PEMSEA Resource Facility

Ms. Diwata Cayaban Programme Assistant PEMSEA Resource Facility

Mr. Jun Dacaymat IT System Administrator PEMSEA Resource Facility Annex 2 AGENDA OF THE MEETING

# FINAL PSC MEETING OF THE GEF/UNDP/PEMSEA PROJECT ON SCALING UP IMPLEMENTATION OF THE SDS-SEA

Virtual Meeting, 18 December 2020

**Provisional Annotated Agenda** 

# 0800 – 0810 **1.0 Opening of the Project Steering Committee Meeting and** Approval of Meeting Agenda

Dr. Selva Ramachandran, Resident Representative, UNDP Philippines will deliver the opening remarks as the Principal Project Resident Representative (PPRR) and Chair of the Meeting.

The Meeting will review and approve the meeting agenda.

# 0810 - 0820 2.0 Matters Arising from the PSC Meeting 2019

The Meeting will review the key recommendations and decisions from the PSC 2019 (April 2019 and July 2019) and status or actions taken as presented by PEMSEA Resource Facility, the regional Implementing Partner (IP).

#### 0820 – 0840 **3.0 Overall Project Accomplishments**

The IP will present the major achievements and lessons learned from the project, including proposed sustainability measures.

# 0840 – 0930 4.0 Terminal Evaluation Findings and Recommendations

The Lead Evaluator, Ms. Stephanie Hodge, will be invited to introduce the scope, process, findings, ratings, conclusions and recommendations from the Terminal Evaluation.

The Meeting will be invited to comment on the TE findings and recommendations for the IP to consolidate into management responses to the TE recommendations.

# 0930 – 0945 **5.0 Project Closure Plan and Implementation**

The Meeting will review the project closure plan, i.e., completion of Project Terminal Evaluation and Technical Reports; financial audit and delivery and projection of project balance to April 2021, asset transfer, knowledge management and hand-over of project outputs to the participating countries.

# 0945 – 1015 6.0 Country Commitments and Continuing Support to SDS-SEA Implementation

Representatives from the 8 participating countries will be invited to reaffirm their commitment to the regional cooperation and partnerships for the continuing implementation of the SDS-SEA and PEMSEA's sustainability.

# 1015 – 1030 **7.0** Wrap up and Closing of the PSC Meeting

Ms. Aimee Gonzales, Executive Director, PEMSEA Resource Facility will give the closing remarks on behalf of the IP.

\*\*\*